

Preface xi

1 Introduction 1

- 1.1 Why Another Book on Anselm's Arguments? 1
- 1.2 Where is 'Anselm's Argument'? 4
- 1.3 The Two Main Divisions 7
- 1.4 The Layout of this Book 9

2 The Text of *Proslogion* 2–4 12

3 The Structure of Anselm's Argument for the Existence of God 18

- 3.1 The Two Styles of Discourse 19
- 3.2 The Quest 21
- 3.3 The Formula 22
- 3.4 The Alleged Definition 27
- 3.5 The Three-Stage Structure 35
- 3.6 The Extended Quest 43

4 The First Stage: Being in the Understanding 45

- 4.1 The 'Title' of P2 45
- 4.2 The Opening Prayer 48
- 4.3 The Formula's Logical Form 52
- 4.4 The Initial Belief 57
- 4.5 Translating "esse" 59
- 4.6 Being in the Fool's Understanding 66
- 4.7 How Thought Signifies 75
- 4.8 The Ambiguity in Thinking of Something 82
- 4.9 A New Beginning 84
- 4.10 Being in Anselm's Understanding 90

5 The First Stage: Being in Reality 99

- 5.1 Being Greater 99
- 5.2 Being in Reality 114
- 5.3 Kant's Thesis 128
- 5.4 Existing Necessarily 132
- 5.5 An Alternative Premise 139

6 The Transition to the Second Stage: Deducing its Premise 143

- 6.1 Gaps in the Argument 143
- 6.2 Inferring Existence from Being in Reality 144
- 6.3 Deducing the Premise of Stage Two 147

7 The Second Stage: Existing Intensely 160

- 7.1 The First Premise 160
- 7.2 The Second Premise 167
- 7.3 Something whose Non-existence is Unthinkable 171
- 7.4 The Alleged Missing Premise 186
- 7.5 Intensifying Existence 195
- 7.6 Deducing Anselm's Actual Conclusion 199
- 7.7 Universalizing the Conclusion 206
- 7.8 The Argument with the Alternative Premise 208

8 The Third Stage: The Existence of God 218

- 8.1 A Two-fold Strategy 218
- 8.2 The Theological Argument 220
- 8.3 The Metaphysical Argument 227
- 8.4 The Uniqueness Argument 234
- 8.5 The Identification of God 241
- 8.6 The Allegation of Begging the Question 251
- 8.7 The Allegation of Circularity 254

- 8.8 A Sceptical Hypothesis 261
- 8.9 The Two Interpretations 268
- 8.10 Existing Most Truly and Maximally 276

9 The Fool and His Defenders 281

- 9.1 The Two Fools 281
- 9.2 The Dialectical Setting 283
- 9.3 The Disappearance of the Fool 287
- 9.4 How it is Possible to Think the Unthinkable 292
- 9.5 Gaunilo's Lost Island 300
- 9.6 'Tidying up' the Lost Island 307
- 9.7 Comparing the Arguments 312
- 9.8 Sinking the Lost Island 316

10 Anselm's Other Arguments 325

- 10.1 The First Leg of the Dilemma in *Reply 1* 325
- 10.2 Possibilities and Necessities 329
- 10.3 The Second Leg of the Dilemma in *Reply 1* 338
- 10.4 The Argument in *Reply 5* 342
- 10.5 The Argument in *Reply 9* 344
- 10.6 Anselm's Causal Argument 357
- 10.7 Thinking of Something-than-which-a-greater-cannot-be-thought 367

11 The Plausibility of the Premises 370

- 11.1 The Plausibility of Stage One 370
 - 11.1.1 *The Concept of Being in the Understanding* 370
 - 11.1.2 *The Concept of Being in Reality* 373
 - 11.1.3 *Why it is Good to be in Reality* 377
 - 11.1.4 *Reasoning about Properties* 379
 - 11.1.5 *Being Thought to be in Reality* 382
 - 11.1.6 *Assessing Stage One* 383
- 11.2 The Plausibility of Stage Two 387
 - 11.2.1 *The Concept of Existing Intensely* 387
 - 11.2.2 *Assessing Stage Two* 391
- 11.3 The Plausibility of Stage Three 393
 - 11.3.1 *The Theological Argument* 393
 - 11.3.2 *The Metaphysical Argument* 394
 - 11.3.3 *Everything Other than God* 395
 - 11.3.4 *Assessing Stage Three* 398
- 11.4 Being Able to Exist or Not to Exist 399
- 11.5 What can be Thought 402

12 The Character of the Argument 405

- 12.1 Anselm's Audience? 405
- 12.2 The Circle of Faith 410
- 12.3 What Kind of Proof? 417
- 12.4 Anselm's Proof and the Ontological Argument 427
- 12.5 Anselm's Cosmological Argument 435

13 The Quest Continues 448

- 13.1 God is '*per se ipsum*' 448
- 13.2 God is the Creator and the Supreme Good 453
- 13.3 God is Whatever it is Better to be than Not to be 460
- 13.4 Some Puzzles about God's Attributes 463
- 13.5 The Anguish of Anselm's Quest 473
- 13.6 God is Greater than can be Thought 476
- 13.7 The Quest to Experience God Resumes 484
- 13.8 Entering into Joy 492

Appendix 499

References 527
Index 532